

Blackburn with Darwen CCG Governing Body and  
East Lancashire CCG Governing Body Meeting in Common

<b>Report Title:</b>	<b>BAME Action Plan Update</b>	<b>Agenda No:</b>	<b>3.7</b>
<b>Meeting Date:</b>	<b>Wednesday, 23 March 2022</b>		
<b>Summary of Report:</b>	The report provided an evaluation of the Unconscious Bias training sessions delivered by the NHS Midlands & Lancashire CSU's Equality and Inclusion Team for all CCG staff.		
<b>Report Recommendations:</b>	<p>Members are asked to receive the report and note the recommendations outlined:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All line managers to discuss this learning opportunity, and any barriers that may be preventing attendance, with their direct reports and ensure that they undertake this training.</li> <li>A significant number of senior leaders and Board Members have not yet undertaken this training – it is recommended that they prioritise undertaking this learning in order to demonstrate the organisational commitment to this area of work.</li> </ul>		
<b>Financial Implications:</b>	n/a		
<b>Procurement Implications:</b>	n/a		
<b>Report Category:</b>			<b>Tick</b>
	Formally Receipt		√
	Decision Required		
	For Discussion		
	Receive the report for information/to note		
<b>Author:</b>	Travis Peters, Equality & Inclusion Business Partner, NHS M&LCSU		
	Report supported & approved by your Senior Lead?		<b>Y</b>
<b>Presented By:</b>	Dr Santhosh Davis & Dr Qashuf Hussain		
<b>Other Committees Consulted:</b>	None		
<b>Privacy Impact Assessment (PIA)</b>	Has a PIA been completed in respect of this report?		<b>N</b>
	If Yes, please attach	If No, provide reason below.	
<b>Equality Impact Analysis (EIA)</b>	Has an EIA been completed in respect of this report?		<b>N</b>
	If Yes, please attach	If No, provide reason below.	
<b>Data Protection Impact Assessment</b>	Is a Data Protection Impact Assessment Required?		<b>N</b>
<b>Risks:</b>	Has a Risk Assessment been undertaken?		<b>N</b>
	Have any risks been identified?		<b>N</b>
<b>Conflict of Interest:</b>	Is there a conflict of interest associated with this report?		<b>N</b>
<b>Clinical Engagement:</b>	Is any clinical engagement/involvement required as part of the proposal being presented?		<b>Y</b>
<b>Patient Engagement:</b>	Is any patient engagement/involvement required as part of the proposal being presented?		<b>N</b>
<b>Privacy Status:</b>	Is the report confidential?		<b>N</b>
<b>Which CCG Corporate Objective does the report relate to:</b>			
<b>CO1</b>	To commission the best quality and effective services to deliver optimal healthcare outcomes for our local population.		
<b>CO2</b>	Ensure the balance of our health investment reflects our population's needs and keeps the population well.		
<b>CO3</b>	Deliver the 10 year strategy by engagement with the population we serve and ensure we		

	commission services that meet local needs with a clear focus on population health management strategies.	
<b>CO4</b>	We will focus on population health outcomes through helping to deliver successful Integrated Care Partnerships and ensure decisions, provision and access to local services is based on the needs of our population.	
<b>CO5</b>	As local health leaders, we will focus on increasing life expectancy across Pennine Lancashire to be at, or above, the national average in the next 10 years.	

**NHS Pennine Clinical  
Commissioning Groups**  
Unconscious Bias Training –  
Evaluation Report

February 2022

---

## 1. Introduction

As part of NHS Pennine Clinical Commissioning Groups' (CCGs) ongoing commitment to tackling workplace racism and their work around ensuring equality of opportunity throughout the workforce, the CCGs' Governing Body agreed to mandate Unconscious Bias training for all CCG staff.

Between September and November 2021, NHS Midlands and Lancashire Commissioning Support Unit's Equality and Inclusion Team delivered 3 Unconscious Bias virtual training sessions to Pennine CCGs' staff. Each session was between 90 minutes and 2 hours long and was designed to give staff an overview of issues relating to Unconscious Bias and to encourage staff to think about where they may be unknowingly applying biased thought(s) within their day-to-day working activities.

This evaluation report provides an overview of the number of staff that attended the Unconscious Bias training sessions, sets out the initial evaluation findings alongside the results of a follow-up survey that was circulated to attendees to gauge the impact that the training sessions has had on attendees, and makes recommendations for next steps in relation to this training activity.

## 2. What is Unconscious Bias Training?

Unconscious (or implicit) bias is a term that describes the associations we hold, outside our conscious awareness and control. Unconscious bias affects everyone.

Unconscious bias is triggered by our brain automatically making quick judgments and assessments. They are influenced by our background, personal experiences, societal stereotypes and cultural context. It is not just about gender, ethnicity or other visible diversity characteristics - height, body weight, names, and many other things can also trigger unconscious bias.

Unconscious bias can have a significant influence on our attitudes and behaviours, especially towards other people. It can influence key decisions in the workplace and can contribute to inequality, for example in selection and recruitment, appraisals, or promotion.

Unconscious biases can influence a person's judgement without them being aware of it. Unconscious bias training in the workplace aims to make people aware of potentially harmful unconscious biases and to reduce the impact of those biases on their interaction with others.

### 3. Staff Uptake

To date, MLCSU's Equality and Inclusion Team has hosted and delivered five Unconscious Bias training sessions. Three of these sessions were delivered exclusively for Pennine CCGs' staff. The table below outlines the number of staff that attended each session:

<b>SESSION 1: Tues 14 September 2021</b>	12 attendees
<b>SESSION 2: Thurs 21 October 2021</b>	25 attendees
<b>SESSION 3: Mon 22 November 2021</b>	21 attendees
<b>TOTAL NO. OF STAFF ATTENDED</b>	<b>58 attendees</b>

Two mop-up sessions were arranged for Pennine CCG staff – these sessions were also opened up to staff across the wider Lancashire and South Cumbria CCGs. The table below outlines the number of staff that attended each mop-up session.

<b>SESSION 4: Tues 25 January 2022</b>	3 attendees from Pennine CCGs	3 attendees from wider LSC CCGs
<b>SESSION 5: Thurs 10 March 2022</b>	2 attendees from Pennine CCGs	0 attendees from wider LSC CCGs
<b>TOTAL NO. OF STAFF ATTENDED</b>	<b>5 attendees from Pennine CCGs</b>	<b>3 attendees from wider LSC CCGs</b>

So far, total staff attendance equates to approximately **38%** of the total workforce of Pennine CCGs. It is noted that staff pressures related to the COVID-19 response and impending system reform may have contributed to low staff uptake. However, it is also noted that this training was introduced as a mandated activity for staff so further efforts should be made to ensure that as many staff as possible engage with future training sessions.

### 4. Evaluation Findings

An initial evaluation survey was circulated to attendees following each training session. Only **19** of the total of 58 attendees completed the survey. However, the survey findings are detailed below:

**Q1: I felt that the training was relevant and supported my needs**

	<b>No. of responses</b>
<b>Strongly agree</b>	9 (47.4%)
<b>Agree</b>	10 (52.6%)
<b>Neither agree nor disagree</b>	0
<b>Disagree</b>	0
<b>Strongly disagree</b>	0

**Q2: The length of the training was appropriate**

	<b>No. of responses</b>
<b>Strongly agree</b>	5 (29.3%)
<b>Agree</b>	13 (68.4%)
<b>Neither agree nor disagree</b>	0
<b>Disagree</b>	1 (5.3%)
<b>Strongly disagree</b>	0

**Q3: Content was helpful and informative**

	<b>No. of responses</b>
<b>Strongly agree</b>	10 (52.6%)
<b>Agree</b>	9 (47.3%)
<b>Neither agree nor disagree</b>	0
<b>Disagree</b>	0
<b>Strongly disagree</b>	0

**Q4: The trainers were clear and easy to understand**

	<b>No. of responses</b>
<b>Strongly agree</b>	13 (68.4%)
<b>Agree</b>	6 (31.6%)
<b>Neither agree nor disagree</b>	0
<b>Disagree</b>	0
<b>Strongly disagree</b>	0

**Q5: Interactive activities were helpful and I wanted to participate**

	No. of responses
<b>Strongly agree</b>	11 (57.9%)
<b>Agree</b>	7 (36.8%)
<b>Neither agree nor disagree</b>	1 (5.3%)
<b>Disagree</b>	0
<b>Strongly disagree</b>	0

**Q6: Is there anything that you would change to improve the training for the future?**

- *If attendees are made provided time to bring their doubts and views for discussion it will enrich the event*
- *perhaps more opportunity for sharing experiences*
- *No*
- *No - the right length of session for the content presented*
- *No*
- *I don't think the break was necessary. It was well presented, but perhaps a bit long winded? good overall and interesting, more real life example would be beneficial to start the awareness side of the objectives.*
- *Given everyone is busy, length of time appropriate but would have been good to have smaller sessions for people to reflect*
- *It's helpful to have case studies / examples - and as a group, to give consideration/ discussion about how we might mitigate. Eg the article re: pulse oximeters - so as a CCG, a discussion around what actions could we do to mitigate this?*
- *Not at all*

**Q7: What elements of the training worked well/what did you particularly enjoy?**

- *All elements worked well*
- *All of it, loved the interaction. It felt like pre-covid times when we were all in a room brainstorming*
- *Interaction*
- *Interactive element worked well*
- *The interactive sessions worked very well.*
- *Use of menti*
- *Clear, crisp slide set and well presented - thank you.*
- *Use of mentimeter. Presenters were good*

- *Excellent, well presented, didn't preach, was very matter of fact and didn't make you feel uncomfortable. **One of the best training sessions I have been to.** Covered a lot of ground but didn't feel rushed. Thank you*
- *Liked the Menti and ability to provide our views into the training - kept it interactive and relevant, thank you*
- *I liked the mix of presentation and interaction*
- *Interactive exercises*
- *liked the interaction and the visuals to help see other participants views and opinions - felt very inclusive.*

## 5. Follow-Up Survey Findings

In December 2021, MLCSU's Equality and Inclusion Team circulated a follow-up survey aimed at gathering further feedback and ascertaining whether staff who attended the initial training sessions have been making any conscious changes to their thinking as a direct result of the training.

The survey consisted of 2 questions and was circulated (with regular reminders) to previous attendees over a period of 4 weeks and was completed by 13 staff members.

The first question of the survey asked learners to rate how useful they found the Unconscious Bias training on a scale of 0 (not useful at all) to 10 (extremely useful). All respondents stated that they found the training useful - **85%** (11) of respondents rated the training at either 9 or 10, with the remaining respondents rating it between 6 and 7.

The second question asked respondents to describe anything that they had done differently since attending the training. The responses received are below:

- *"Been more aware of the potential for unconscious bias and considered where other people may have been unaware of their unconscious bias to challenge assumptions"*
- *"Been mindful of own bias and also challenging other people's bias where its evident"*
- *"I have been aware of my own unconscious bias and address it more effectively. I have also been able to identify areas of bias in the working environment"*
- *"Maybe making the session a little longer would be beneficial"*
- *"I haven't done much differently as WFH is quite restrictive in terms of seeing and challenging own and others bias"*
- *"Awareness is the most important thing – I cannot think of anything practical that has changed but having the further insight helps"*
- *"Trying to talk about it with my colleagues"*
- *"Been more aware of how I phrase things"*
- *"I have been more aware of unconscious bias and how it can impact upon thinking"*
- *"I take check of myself and my understanding of situations"*
- *"Been more aware of what I say and do at work"*
- *"Have not done anything different, just more aware"*
- *"The training provided a useful insight and highlighted areas that we perhaps would not associate with unconscious bias, making me think more about particular situations, and if things could be managed differently"*

## 6. Next Steps

The CCGs may wish to consider hosting further mop-up sessions to improve upon the low uptake of this mandated training activity for Pennine CCG staff, and the wider LSC CCGs workforce.

In order to improve the uptake rate for this mandated training activity, the following recommendations are made:

- **All line managers to discuss this learning opportunity, and any barriers that may be preventing attendance, with their direct reports and ensure that they undertake this training.**
- **A significant number of senior leaders and Board Members have not yet undertaken this training – it is recommended that they prioritise undertaking this learning in order to demonstrate the organisational commitment to this area of work.**